

RAJYA SABHA  
(1978)

**Point of privilege**

*Physically restraining a member from addressing the House by another member*

**Facts of the case and ruling by the Chairman**

On the 21st February, 1978, during the course of proceedings <sup>1</sup> in the House regarding alleged disrespect shown to Shri Jagjivan Ram, Minister of Defence, at Varanasi, Shri Piare Lall Kureel urf Piare Lall Talib, a member, went across the floor to physically restrain Shri Nageshwar Prasad Shahi, another member, who was speaking from addressing the House.

2. Thereupon, the Deputy-Chairman (Shri Ram Niwas Mirdha) Inter alia observed <sup>2</sup> as follows:-

"I will request that the proceedings of the House should be conducted peacefully in the required manner. The scene created a short-while ago cannot but be deplored. I do not want to add anything more. The hon. member is an elderly person. I do not think it proper to say anything more nor it would be fair on my part to take any action on it. I would like to request that the gravity of the incident should be realised by the hon. member as well as by all other hon. members ... If anything is said in the House which is wrong in the opinion of the hon. members, they can raise objections and there are certain ways to raise them.... It is not proper to interrupt the proceedings of the House in such manner. You may be given an opportunity to express your unhappiness in accordance with the procedure of the House."

3. A little later, Shri Piare Lall Kureel urf Piare Lall Talib, while regretting the incident, stated <sup>3</sup> as under:--

"Sir, I beg your pardon. I did that in the heat of the moment. I shall not repeat it in future .... I really regret it."

4. On the 22nd February, 1978, the Chairman (Shri B. P. Jatti) informed <sup>4</sup> the House as follows: --

"I have received a notice of breach of privilege from Shri Sujan Singh against Shri Piare Lall Kureel urf Piare Lall Talib, another Member. regarding the incident which took Place in the House yesterday. Shri Talib, it appears, went across the floor to physically restrain Shri Nageshwar Prasad Shahi from addressing the House as Shri Talib objected to some observation made

1. R. S. debt. dt. 21-2-1978.

2. Ibid (Original in Hindi)

3. Ibid

4. Ibid dt. 22.2.1978

by the latter. This is the first time in the history of Rajya Sabha

that such an incident has taken place and I am greatly distressed by the lack of orderly conduct shown by Shri Talib which is expected from every Member of the House.

I have no doubt that Shri Talib's conduct yesterday, whatever, the provocation, amounts to contempt of the House which the House could have condemned then and there. The reputation of the House is sullied by such action which cannot be tolerated. However, in view of the apology tendered by Shri Talib and the observation made by the Deputy Chairman, I will allow the matter to rest there.

I hope and trust that the House will never witness such an incident in future. This is my personal request to you all so that we can carry on the work in a very orderly manner."

5. The matter was, thereafter, closed.

1. R.S. Deb. dt. 21-2-1987

2. Ibid dt. 22-2-1978